### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

STATE OF OKLAHOMA,	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
v	)	Cara Na of 200 CHZP/CA D
v.	)	Case No. 05-cv-329-GKF(SAJ)
TYSON FOODS, INC., et al.,	)	
Defendants.	)	

# STATE OF OKLAHOMA'S RESPONSE TO "DEFENDANTS' NOTICE TO THE COURT ON THEIR JOINT MOTION FOR ADDITIONAL TIME TO PRODUCE EXPERT REPORTS [DKT #1722]" DKT #1754

Plaintiff, the State of Oklahoma, ex rel. W.A. Drew Edmondson, in his capacity as

Attorney General of the State of Oklahoma and Oklahoma Secretary of the Environment C.

Miles Tolbert, in his capacity as the Trustee for Natural Resources for the State of Oklahoma

("the State"), respectfully responds to "Defendants' Notice to the Court on Their Joint Motion for Additional Time to Produce Expert Reports [DKT #1722]" DKT #1754 as follows:

In response to being advised by Defendants of Dr. John Connolly's family medical issues, the State has readily agreed to a two-month extension of the deadline for the disclosure of his expert report. However, Defendants are seeking a nearly six-month extension of this deadline without providing any basis for why such a lengthy extension is necessary. Neither have Defendants explained why a two-month extension would be inadequate in this situation.

In particular, Defendants have failed to provide any detailed information about: (1) the substantive area of Dr. Connolly's anticipated testimony; (2) any detailed information about the

Without defining his role *in this case*, Defendants' Notice merely states that Dr. Connolly has expertise in an extraordinarily broad number of areas that may be relevant to the issues in this case, including but not limited to sampling, fate and transport, ecosystem processes

current status of Dr. Connolly's report;<sup>2</sup> or (3) any detailed information about the anticipated amount of time Dr. Connolly's personal obligations will take him away from his work on this case. Without additional information demonstrating the necessity of such a lengthy extension under the circumstances, the request for a nearly six-month extension at this time is inappropriate and -- particularly given the apparent centrality of Dr. Connolly's opinions to Defendants' defense -- would be unfairly prejudicial to the State. See DKT #1736, pp. 23-25 (outlining prejudice created by Defendants' request for extensions).

As noted above, the State agreed that a two-month extension is warranted in response to Dr. Connolly's family medical situation. However, to the extent additional time is required, the State submits that a step-wise approach would be the most appropriate way to address this situation. If in early October it becomes apparent that this issue needs to be revisited, then Defendants could file a motion supported by evidence seeking an appropriate additional extension.

Respectfully Submitted,

W.A. Drew Edmondson OBA # 2628 ATTORNEY GENERAL Kelly H. Burch OBA #17067 J. Trevor Hammons OBA #20234 Daniel P. Lennington OBA #21577 ASSISTANT ATTORNEYS GENERAL State of Oklahoma 313 N.E. 21st St. Oklahoma City, OK 73105 (405) 521-3921

and ecotoxicology. Defendants' Notice also suggests that Dr. Connolly might be offering opinions in the areas of exposure assessment, risk assessment and remedial options.

<sup>2</sup> It should not be overlooked that the primary expert disclosure deadline in this case is August 14, 2008, and therefore Dr. Connolly should already have much of his expert work nearly completed.

#### /s/ M. David Riggs

M. David Riggs OBA #7583
Joseph P. Lennart OBA #5371
Richard T. Garren OBA #3253
Sharon K. Weaver OBA #19010
Robert A. Nance OBA #6581
D. Sharon Gentry OBA #15641
David P. Page OBA #6852
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN, ORBISON & LEWIS
502 West Sixth Street
Tulsa, OK 74119
(918) 587-3161

Louis W. Bullock OBA #1305 Robert M. Blakemore OBA 18656 BULLOCK, BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE 110 West Seventh Street Suite 707 Tulsa OK 74119 (918) 584-2001

Frederick C. Baker (admitted pro hac vice)
Lee M. Heath (admitted pro hac vice)
Elizabeth C. Ward (admitted pro hac vice)
Elizabeth Claire Xidis (admitted pro hac vice)
MOTLEY RICE, LLC
28 Bridgeside Boulevard
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465
(843) 216-9280

William H. Narwold (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Ingrid L. Moll (admitted *pro hac vice*)
MOTLEY RICE, LLC
20 Church Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor
Hartford, CT 06103
(860) 882-1676

Jonathan D. Orent (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Michael G. Rousseau (admitted pro hac vice) Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick (admitted pro hac vice) MOTLEY RICE, LLC 321 South Main Street Providence, RI 02940 (401) 457-7700

Attorneys for the State of Oklahoma

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 7th day of August, 2008, I electronically transmitted the above and foregoing pleading to the Clerk of the Court using the ECF System for filing and a transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

W. A. Drew Edmondson, Attorney General Kelly H. Burch, Assistant Attorney General J. Trevor Hammons, Assistant Attorney General Daniel P. Lennington, Assistant Attorney General

fc docket@oag.state.ok.us kelly\_burch@oag.state.ok.us trevor hammons@oag.state.ok.us daniel.lennington@oag.ok.gov

M. David Riggs Joseph P. Lennart Richard T. Garren Sharon K. Weaver Robert A. Nance D. Sharon Gentry David P. Page

driggs@riggsabney.com jlennart@riggsabney.com rgarren@riggsabney.com sweaver@riggsabney.com rnance@riggsabney.com sgentry@riggsabney.com dpage@riggsabney.com

RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN, ORBISON & LEWIS

Louis Werner Bullock Robert M. Blakemore BULLOCK, BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE

lbullock@bullock-blakemore.com bblakemore@bullock-blakemore.com

Frederick C. Baker Lee M. Heath Elizabeth C. Ward Elizabeth Claire Xidis William H. Narwold Ingrid L. Moll Jonathan D. Orent Michael G. Rousseau Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick MOTLEY RICE, LLC

fbaker@motleyrice.com lheath@motleyrice.com lward@motleyrice.com cxidis@motleyrice.com bnarwold@motleyrice.com imoll@motleyrice.com jorent@motleyrice.com mrousseau@motleyrice.com ffitzpatrick@motleyrice.com

Counsel for State of Oklahoma

Robert P. Redemann rredemann@pmrlaw.net
Lawrence W. Zeringue lzeringue@pmrlaw.net
David C. Senger dsenger@pmrlaw.net
PERRINE, MCGIVERN, REDEMANN, REID, BARRY & TAYLOR, P.L.L.C.

Robert E Sanders rsanders@youngwilliams.com
Edwin Stephen Williams steve.williams@youngwilliams.com

YOUNG WILLIAMS P.A.

#### Counsel for Cal-Maine Farms, Inc and Cal-Maine Foods, Inc.

John H. Tucker jtucker@rhodesokla.com
Theresa Noble Hill thill@rhodesokla.com
Colin Hampton Tucker ctucker@rhodesokla.com
Leslie Jane Southerland ljsoutherland@rhodesokla.com

RHODES, HIERONYMUS, JONES, TUCKER & GABLE

Terry Wayen West terry@thewestlawfirm.com

THE WEST LAW FIRM

Delmar R. Ehrich dehrich@faegre.com
Bruce Jones bjones@faegre.com
Krisann C. Kleibacker Lee kklee@faegre.com
Todd P. Walker twalker@faegre.com
Christopher H. Dolan cdolan@faegre.com

FAEGRE & BENSON, LLP

Dara D. Mann dmann@mckennalong.com

MCKENNA, LONG & ALDRIDGE LLP

#### Counsel for Cargill, Inc. & Cargill Turkey Production, LLC

James Martin Graves jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com
Gary V Weeks gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com
Paul E. Thompson, Jr. pthompson@bassettlawfirm.com
Woody Bassett wbassettlawfirm.com
K. C. Dupps Tucker kctucker@bassettlawfirm.com

**BASSETT LAW FIRM** 

George W. Owens
Randall E. Rose
gwo@owenslawfirmpc.com
rer@owenslawfirmpc.com

OWENS LAW FIRM, P.C.

Counsel for George's Inc. & George's Farms, Inc.

A. Scott McDaniel smcdaniel@mhla-law.com Nicole Longwell nlongwell@mhla-law.com Philip Hixon phixon@mhla-law.com Craig A. Merkes cmerkes@mhla-law.com MCDANIEL, HIXON, LONGWELL & ACORD, PLLC

Sherry P. Bartley sbartley@mwsgw.com MITCHELL, WILLIAMS, SELIG, GATES & WOODYARD, PLLC

Counsel for Peterson Farms, Inc.

John Elrod jelrod@cwlaw.com Vicki Bronson vbronson@cwlaw.com P. Joshua Wisley jwisley@cwlaw.com Bruce W. Freeman bfreeman@cwlaw.com D. Richard Funk rfunk@cwlaw.com CONNER & WINTERS, LLP

Counsel for Simmons Foods, Inc.

Stephen L. Jantzen sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com Paula M. Buchwald pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com Patrick M. Ryan pryan@ryanwhaley.com

RYAN, WHALEY, COLDIRON & SHANDY, P.C.

Mark D. Hopson mhopson@sidley.com Jay Thomas Jorgensen jjorgensen@sidley.com Timothy K. Webster twebster@sidley.com Thomas C. Green tcgreen@sidley.com Gordon D. Todd gtodd@sidley.com

SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD LLP

Robert W. George robert.george@tyson.com L. Bryan Burns bryan.burns@tyson.com TYSON FOODS, INC

Michael R. Bond michael.bond@kutakrock.com Erin W. Thompson erin.thompson@kutakrock.com KUTAK ROCK, LLP

Counsel for Tyson Foods, Inc., Tyson Poultry, Inc., Tyson Chicken, Inc., & Cobb-Vantress, Inc.

R. Thomas Lay rtl@kiralaw.com

KERR, IRVINE, RHODES & ABLES

Jennifer Stockton Griffin **David Gregory Brown** LATHROP & GAGE LC

jgriffin@lathropgage.com

Counsel for Willow Brook Foods, Inc.

Robin S Conrad

rconrad@uschamber.com

NATIONAL CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER

Gary S Chilton

gchilton@hcdattorneys.com

HOLLADAY, CHILTON AND DEGIUSTI, PLLC

Counsel for US Chamber of Commerce and American Tort Reform Association

D. Kenyon Williams, Jr. Michael D. Graves

kwilliams@hallestill.com

mgraves@hallestill.com

HALL, ESTILL, HARDWICK, GABLE, GOLDEN & NELSON

Counsel for Poultry Growers/Interested Parties/ Poultry Partners, Inc.

Richard Ford LeAnne Burnett **CROWE & DUNLEVY**  richard.ford@crowedunlevy.com leanne.burnett@crowedunlevy.com

Counsel for Oklahoma Farm Bureau, Inc.

Kendra Akin Jones, Assistant Attorney General Charles L. Moulton, Sr Assistant Attorney General Kendra.Jones@arkansasag.gov Charles.Moulton@arkansasag.gov

Counsel for State of Arkansas and Arkansas National Resources Commission

Mark Richard Mullins

richard.mullins@mcafeetaft.com

MCAFEE & TAFT

Counsel for Texas Farm Bureau; Texas Cattle Feeders Association; Texas Pork Producers Association and Texas Association of Dairymen

Mia Vahlberg

mvahlberg@gablelaw.com

**GABLE GOTWALS** 

James T. Banks Adam J. Siegel

jtbanks@hhlaw.com ajsiegel@hhlaw.com

HOGAN & HARTSON, LLP

Counsel for National Chicken Council; U.S. Poultry and Egg Association & National Turkey

**Federation** 

John D. Russell FELLERS, SNIDER, BLANKENSHIP, BAILEY & TIPPENS, PC jrussell@fellerssnider.com

William A. Waddell, Jr.
David E. Choate
FRIDAY, ELDREDGE & CLARK, LLP
Counsel for Arkansas Farm Bureau Federation

waddell@fec.net dchoate@fec.net

Barry Greg Reynolds Jessica E. Rainey TITUS, HILLIS, REYNOLDS, LOVE, DICKMAN & MCCALMON reynolds@titushillis.com jrainey@titushillis.com

Nikaa Baugh Jordan William S. Cox, III LIGHTFOOT, FRANKLIN & WHITE, LLC njordan@lightfootlaw.com wcox@lightfootlaw.com

Counsel for American Farm Bureau and National Cattlemen's Beef Association

Also on this 7th day of August, 2008 I mailed a copy of the above and foregoing pleading to:

#### **David Gregory Brown**

Lathrop & Gage LC 314 E HIGH ST JEFFERSON CITY, MO 65101

#### **Thomas C Green**

Sidley Austin Brown & Wood LLP 1501 K ST NW WASHINGTON, DC 20005

#### **Dustin McDaniel**

Justin Allen

Office of the Attorney General (Little Rock) 323 Center St, Ste 200 Little Rock, AR 72201-2610

#### Steven B. Randall

58185 County Road 658 Kansas, Ok 74347 Cary Silverman Victor E Schwartz Shook Hardy & Bacon LLP (Washington DC) 600 14TH ST NW STE 800 WASHINGTON, DC 20005-2004

## **George R. Stubblefield** HC 66, Box 19-12

Proctor, Ok 74457

#### **C** Miles Tolbert

Secretary of the Environment State of Oklahoma 3800 NORTH CLASSEN OKLAHOMA CITY, OK 73118

/s/ M. David Riggs	